

A Review of Domestic Cultural Tourism Research in the Past Decade

Peiyu Yue, Yan Zhang

School of Tourism and Culture Industry, Chengdu University, Chengdu, Sichuan Province, China

Keywords: Cultural tourism, Research progress, Review

Abstract: With the rapid development of economy and society, the level of demand of tourist consumers is constantly rising, and the satisfaction of cultural needs has gradually become the main motivation for tourists to travel, and cultural tourism has become an important way for tourists to achieve tourism demands. Local governments have also issued various policies to vigorously develop cultural tourism as a focus of normalization. In this context, cultural tourism has attracted more and more attention and in-depth research from more and more scholars and institutions. This paper combed the research literature of cultural tourism in China in recent 10 years (2010-2019), analyzed the research progress of cultural tourism in China in recent years, and discussed the deficiencies in the previous research and the potential areas of follow-up research, with a view to providing references for better research and development of cultural tourism.

1. Introduction

In recent years, cultural tourism has become one of the most important forms of tourism. According to a survey by the Association for Tourism and Leisure Education and Research (ATLAS): “Cultural tourism is the fastest growing region in global tourism demand.” Facing the increasing demand for tourism, academic research on cultural tourism is also increasing [1]. Domestic cultural tourism research started relatively late, “most of them are concentrated on the development and management of a certain place or type of cultural resources, and there is a lack of systematic research on cultural tourism as a whole” [2]. In order to grasp the latest research trends and further advance the research of cultural tourism, this paper used the CNKI series database platform to summarize and analyze Chinese cultural tourism research literature from 2010 to 2019 in the past ten years. It combed the current status and trends of cultural tourism research in China, and put forward prospects for the possible further research directions of cultural tourism, hoping to provide some new research perspectives for future cultural tourism research.

2. Research Design

Focusing on the research goals, this research was designed to choose to search for the literature in the field of cultural tourism in China National Knowledge Infrastructure (CNKI) digital library. It reviewed and analyzed the representative documents from the core journals, mainstream journals or doctoral and master theses in the field of tourism. For example, the core and mainstream journals in the domestic tourism field: *Tourism Tribune*, *Tourism Science*, *Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month)*, *Tourism Overview (Industry Edition)*, *Human Geography*, *Economic Geography*, *Vacation Tour*, *Tourism Forum*, *Tourism Research*, etc.

Here is the specific method of document retrieval: first, “cultural tourism” and “cultural tourism research” were used as search terms to perform a general search in CNKI. Then, the literature with “cultural tourism” appearing in the topics, titles and keywords and published between 2010 and 2019 was advanced searched in the database. Finally, duplicate and redundant papers were eliminated according to their document sources and relevance.

Next, the author carefully read the abstracts of all the documents collected to ensure that the selected papers are consistent with the subject of this research. For documents that do not provide enough information in the abstract, the author read the full text throughout to decide whether they are qualified. After such article retrieval and screening procedures, a total of 59 papers and

documents related to China's cultural tourism research in the past ten years were obtained. Next, the author formulated a corresponding coding table for the collected documents. The coding table mainly includes five aspects, namely the year of publication, the name of the journal, the research topics, research methods, and the research results.

3. Summary Results and Analysis

3.1 Literature Year and Journal Distribution

First, “cultural tourism” was used as the search term through the titles and keywords. At the same time, the time for publication was limited from 2010-2019. Then, advanced search was performed in the CNKI database. As a result, a total of 2562 papers were directly related to cultural tourism. It can be found that the number of documents related to cultural tourism in the past ten years is very large, and the research results are rich. By using the source of the document as a further screening condition, the scope of the number of documents was narrowed, so that the representative literature in the field of cultural tourism was sorted out and studied.

This paper mainly sorted out 59 Chinese papers directly related to cultural tourism in core tourism journals and mainstream journals from 2010 to 2019. Table 1 listed the number of these papers published in different years. The data shows that the number of literature on cultural tourism research published in tourism core journals or mainstream journals in the past ten years ranges from 0 to 10, of which 2010 was the least, with zero publications. 2012 was the most, with 10 publications, followed by 2019, with 9 publications. There were 8 publications in 2014 and 2017 separately. From 2016 to 2019, the number of literature related to cultural tourism had basically been on the rise, with an average of 5 publications published. Compared with 2010-2019, the fluctuation range was smaller, and it was more of a stable rise. It can also be seen that in recent years, the tourism academic circle has paid more and more attention to the field of cultural tourism.

This research also shows (as shown in Table 2) that there were 7 core journals or mainstream journals with related papers, and the number of papers in each journal was also very different. There were 4 journals with two related papers and above. These journals were *Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month)*, *Tourism Overview (Industry Edition)*, *Tourism Tribune* and *Vacation Tour*. Among them, *Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month)* was the journal that published the most such papers (35 papers), the second was *Tourism Overview (Industry Edition)* and *Vacation Tour* (8 papers each). The third was *Tourism Tribune* (3 papers). In addition to these four major journals, although there were such papers in the other three journals, there were only 2 or 1 papers. These three journals were *Tourism Research*, *Tourism Forum* and *Tourism Science*.

Table 1 Number of Papers Published in Each Year

Year	Number
2010	0
2011	6
2012	10
2013	4
2014	8
2015	2
2016	6
2017	8
2018	6
2019	9
Total(10 years):59	

Table 2 Number of Publications in Various Core and Mainstream Journals in the Field of Cultural Tourism Research in China

Name	Numbers
<i>Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month)</i>	35

<i>Tourism Overview (Industry Edition)</i>	8
<i>Tourism Tribune</i>	3
<i>Vacation Tour</i>	8
<i>Tourism Research</i>	2
<i>Tourism Forum</i>	2
<i>Tourism Science</i>	1

3.2 Scope of Research Topics

Since the subject of this study is cultural tourism, the themes of the retrieved papers are also concentrated in the direction of cultural tourism. Table 3 shows that most of the papers (77.9%) in the past ten years still focused on the development and utilization of cultural tourism resources of a certain place or type. In addition, other papers on cultural tourism mainly focused on the integration of culture and tourism industry (8.5%), cultural tourism destination research (6.8%), cultural tourist and market research (5.1%), and cultural tourism research (1.7%). Some research themes were relatively new themes, such as the integration of culture and tourism industry. Because they have only received attention in recent years, they are not very popular. However, with the continuous in-depth development of cultural tourism, there are more and more researches in this area, and even become a new round of popular research topics in cultural tourism.

Table 3 Scope of Research Topics

Research topics	Number	Ratio(%)
Development and utilization of cultural tourism resources	46	77.9
Integration of culture and tourism industry	5	8.5
Research on cultural tourism destinations	4	6.8
Cultural tourists and market research,	3	5.1
Cultural tourism research	1	1.7

3.3 Analysis of Research Methods

Relevant research methods are often used in academic activities to solve research problems or relationships. This paper summarized the research methods used in cultural tourism related literature from three aspects: research types, research design and data analysis methods. From the perspective of research types, empirical research dominated, while conceptual research papers were rare. From the perspective of research design, questionnaire survey methods accounted for the majority, followed by in-depth interviews, literature review/content analysis, while other research methods such as second-hand data, experiments, yearbook data, ethnographic methods, and model analysis were infrequently used. From the perspective of data analysis methods, qualitative research methods were mainly used, which accounted for 52.5% of the total. Quantitative research accounted for 25.4%. 13.6% of the papers used both quantitative and qualitative research. The proportion of qualitative research declined compared with before, and the proportion of the combination of quantitative and qualitative research increased. In addition to quantitative and qualitative research, a small number of studies used conceptual research methods (8.5%).

Table 4 Data Analysis Methods

Data analysis methods	Number	Ratio(%)
Qualitative research	31	52.5
Quantitative research	15	25.4
Combination of quantitative and qualitative research	8	13.6
Concept research	5	8.5

3.4 Analysis of Research Results

Judging from the literature research results in 2010-2019, the research on cultural tourism in the tourism academia mainly focused on the development and utilization of cultural tourism resources, research on cultural tourism destinations, research on cultural tourists and markets, and integration

of culture and tourism industries. Here is the detailed analysis:

3.4.1 The Development and Utilization of Cultural Tourism Resources

The current research on cultural tourism resources is mainly based on qualitative research. It comprehensively uses quantitative methods such as analytic hierarchy process and fuzzy comprehensive evaluation method to analyze tourism resources with religious culture, ethnic minority culture and characteristic culture. Among them, the research focus of religious culture is mainly Buddhist culture and Taoist culture. The research focus of ethnic minority culture is the ethnic tourism culture of Manchu, Tibetan nationality, Hui nationality and Xiangxi Miao nationality. The research on characteristic culture mainly focuses on tea culture and film and television culture.

In the field of religious culture research, religious culture has a high development value due to its own unique belief specificity and inheritance. However, in the past ten years, especially in recent years, religious topics were sensitive, so the academic circle was sensitive to it. There were not many researches on cultural tourism, but the research on religious cultural tourism is an area that cannot be ignored in the development of cultural tourism resources. It plays an important role in the in-depth development of cultural tourism [3-4].

From the analysis from the literature in the past ten year, it can be inferred that the academic circle has relatively mature research on ethnic minority cultures. Many academic achievements have been made. Their research in the past ten years mainly focused on the problems existing in the development of ethnic minority cultures. One of the problems was that the distribution of benefits caused by the unclear property rights of ethnic cultural tourism resources was more difficult. Secondly, the ignorance of minority ownership of cultural tourism resources was also an urgent problem to be solved [5-8]. At the same time, many studies used the SWOT analysis method to analyze the cultural tourism of ethnic minorities such as Jingxi Zhuang nationality, Xiangxi minor nationalities, and Liaoning Manchu, and put forward countermeasures for their future development. The authors helped these national minorities recognize the development status of their own cultural tourism industry, and fully use the advantages, avoid disadvantages, seize opportunities, and face challenges [9-11]. The development of ethnic cultural tourism should focus on protection and proper development. On the basis of protecting traditional culture, the minority nationalities should bring in professional talents. They should focus on the cooperation between the government and tourism enterprises. Moreover, they should innovate tourism resources development methods, to create quality products.

For the study of characteristic culture, scholars in the past ten years mainly focused on the analysis of tea culture and film and television culture. For areas with rich tea resources, a long history of tea culture, and favorable conditions for tea culture development, some problems in the development of tea culture were analyzed, such as insufficient understanding of the connotation of tea culture tourism, imperfect tourism infrastructure, and lack of features in tea culture tourism activities. They also analyzed the lack of depth and intensity of brand promotion, and proposed targeted suggestions for the development of tea culture [12-13]. Secondly, regarding film and television culture, based on the diversification of film and television cultural carriers brought about by the development of science and technology and the importance of culture in tourism development, the scholars re-examined the issue of the common development of the film and television cultural industry and tourism from the perspective of industrial integration. They used SWOT analysis method to analyze the advantages and disadvantages, opportunities and challenges of the development of film and television cultural tourism, and put forward targeted suggestions [14].

3.4.2 Research on Cultural Tourism Destinations

For the study of cultural tourism destinations, many researchers used a certain tourism destination as an example to conduct research and discussion on the development of cultural tourism destinations. For example, Guo Yongjia took Jilin Province as an example, conducted a comprehensive analysis of the type, value, development and utilization of cultural tourism in Jilin Province based on related theories, and put forward a targeted development strategy for cultural

tourism destinations in Jilin Province to promote cultural tourism in Jilin Province [15]. Zhang Ailing took the Goddess Peak in Wushan County as an example to dig deeper into the goddess culture. She focused on combining the love culture with the natural landscape of the Goddess Peak, and developed love culture tourism. She demonstrated the feasibility of its development, and proposed corresponding development countermeasures [16]. At the same time, some scholars also proposed that film and television provide tourist attractions with a brand-new experience interpretation that is different from historical geography in the past. It enables tourists to have more imagination about attractions. The development of film and television tourism has an impact on the economic development of cultural tourism destinations. The publicity of scenic spots has a positive impact, but problems such as scene differences, insufficient local infrastructure and imperfect services will cause the loss of tourists.

3.4.3 Research on Cultural Tourists and Markets

Shen Canyu and Zeng Huizhu studied the current situation of Harbin cultural tourism development from the perspective of tourist satisfaction. They used field investigation, second-hand data analysis and questionnaire survey, as well as Spss18.0 to analyze the reliability and validity of the questionnaire survey results. Based on the analysis of variance, and based on the survey results, the corresponding countermeasures for the development of cultural tourism in Harbin were put forward, namely, building and promoting cultural tourism product brands, producing personalized cultural tourism products, and improving the quality of cultural tourism products, etc. [17].

Xie Chunshan and Yu Xia believe that the development of cultural tourism is a multi-party game process involving tourists, developers, local governments, destination residents, experts and scholars, social media, and many other stakeholders. Different values, values, goal pursuits and participation levels have different interest demands on cultural tourism, which directly or indirectly affect the development direction and path selection of cultural tourism. Only by taking appropriate measures from the macro, meso and micro levels to improve government supervision, improve legal protection, establish a communication platform, promote win-win negotiations, strengthen self-discipline and mutual supervision, and coordinate the relationship between various stakeholders can the healthy and sustainable development of tourism culture be finally realized [18].

Chen Xuechun and Ye Yali pointed out that Chengdu is one of the first batch of 24 historical and cultural cities announced by the State Council. It is also the permanent venue of China's intangible cultural heritage festival. However, in recent years, outdated and singular product types, disordered management and mediocre image have hindered the further development of the local tourism market. Based on the analysis of Chengdu's cultural tourism resources and cultural tourism market position, they put forward some innovative development strategies based on Chengdu's cultural tourism market. Some scholars also discovered that the cultural goals pursued by heritage tourists and the uniqueness of different cultures fundamentally determine the attractiveness of intangible cultural heritage to tourists. The core appeal of cultural heritage tourists lies in the learning and experience of culture. The higher the education level of tourists, the higher their awareness of cultural heritage tourism [19].

3.4.4 Integration of Culture and Tourism Industries

As a new development model that has emerged in recent years, the integration of culture and tourism industries has been strongly supported by national policies. In 2014, the State Council promulgated *Several Opinions on Promoting the Integration and Development of Cultural Creativity and Design Services and Related Industries* to encourage and promote the mutual integration of cultural and tourism industries, hoping to realize the mutual transformation between culture and tourism products. As a "pillar industry of the national economy", the cultural industry has broad space for cooperation with the tourism industry. In 2018, the original Ministry of Culture and the National Tourism Administration were merged to form the Ministry of Culture and Tourism. The main purpose of establishing the Ministry of Culture and Tourism is to enhance and demonstrate cultural self-confidence, coordinate the development of cultural undertakings, cultural industries and the development of tourism resources, and improve the country's cultural soft power

and international influence. It is also a way to promote the organic integration and development of cultural undertakings, cultural industries and tourism industries. Domestic scholars highly affirm the integration and development of culture and tourism industry. They believe that the integration of the economic attributes of culture and the cultural attributes of the economy can form an important competitiveness. Li Ling took the cultural and creative product development of the Forbidden City in Beijing as an example. She briefly introduced the research status of cultural tourism and cultural industry through a literature review. Then she reviewed and analyzed the integrated development of tourism and cultural industries. In the end, she used text analysis methods with the help of ROST Content Mining functional analysis software to analyze the evaluation of the cultural and creative products of the Forbidden City on Taobao and drew some conclusions: Consumers generally have a positive attitude towards the cultural and creative products of the Forbidden City on Taobao. They identify with certain cultures. Li Ling believes that cultural and creative products will become a strong glue for the integration and development of culture and tourism in the future [20].

4. Conclusion and Enlightenment

4.1 Weaknesses in Previous Research

Through the comprehensive analysis of the above-mentioned cultural tourism research results, it can be found that the research on cultural tourism carried out by the tourism academic circle in the past ten years includes both macroscopic and microscopic research, with relatively large data capacity and using a variety of theories and methods. The research content mainly involves the development and utilization of cultural tourism resources, the research of cultural tourism destinations, the research of cultural tourists and the market, and the integration of culture and tourism industry. As far as its connotation is concerned, it mainly includes the development and utilization of cultural tourism resources and products of various places or types, cultural tourism infrastructure construction, cultural tourism brand building, cultural tourism marketing, cultural tourism competitiveness, cultural tourism scenic spots, cultural tourism industry, cultural tourism environment protection, tourist satisfaction, and inheritance of traditional culture, etc. However, there are still the following shortcomings:

First, there are few research results on the basic theories of cultural tourism. Cultural tourism, as an important way to promote social, economic and cultural development in the new era since the 21st century, has attracted widespread attention from scholars and promoted the research in the field of Chinese cultural tourism. Judging from the existing research results, empirical research has absolute advantages, mainly descriptive conceptual analysis, but also certain qualitative and quantitative research. However, the lack of a unified theoretical support and research framework has led to inconsistent construction of the cultural tourism theoretical research system. At the same time, there isn't much application of tourism life cycle theory, tourism space competition theory, tourism consumption utility theory, regional cooperation theory, and supply and demand theory.

Second, the content structure of cultural tourism research is not yet perfect. The current research on cultural tourism mainly focuses on cultural tourism objects. There are relatively many research results on the development status, existing problems and development models of special cultural tourism resources such as red culture, religious culture and folk culture. There are relatively fewer studies with the main body of cultural tourism which is tourists and other stakeholders. At present, although academic research on the development path of cultural tourism continues to deepen, most of the research focus is still based on the perspective of cultural tourism development. The depth and system of research need to be strengthened. At the same time, the study of the characteristics, negative impacts and countermeasures of cultural tourism is also relatively niche. Although cultural tourism has huge comprehensive benefits, it will be difficult to realize its sustainable development if cultural tourism resources are not effectively protected in time. Therefore, it is necessary to learn from the theories of other disciplines at home and abroad and to improve the research methods, continuously enrich the research content of cultural tourism, and optimize the research structure of cultural tourism.

4.2 Prospects for Follow-Up Research

As an important way to promote cultural prosperity and a strong tourism country, cultural tourism will continue to be a key research topic in the future academic circle. Based on the existing research results and research experience, it is necessary to strengthen the following four aspects:

First, try to absorb the theories of other disciplines to further improve and enrich the research framework and theoretical system of cultural tourism. It is necessary to fully absorb the theories of other disciplines, introduce them into the research of cultural tourism, and establish a standardized cultural tourism research framework. Moreover, it is also necessary to continuously improve the theoretical system of cultural tourism research, combine the current status of cultural tourism development in various regions and characteristic tourism resources, and propose development strategies that fully reflect the regional characteristics and the corresponding cultural connotation.

Second, it is a must-do to strengthen the combination of multidisciplinary theory and qualitative and quantitative research. Cultural tourism research involves a wide range of areas. It is often difficult for single-disciplinary theories to explain the complexity of cultural tourism, and it is difficult to give full play to its versatility. Therefore, scholars must be good at integrating economics, management, psychology, sociology, anthropology, pedagogy, geography and statistics and other multidisciplinary theories. They should comprehensively use a variety of research methods, and continuously improve the breadth and depth of their cultural tourism research. In this way, they can produce more valuable research results, so as to better give play to the practical guiding role of theoretical research in the field of cultural tourism.

Third, it is needful to strengthen research on the protection of various cultural tourism resources and their benefit distribution mechanisms. Except for man-made tourism resources, most cultural tourism resources are obviously non-renewable. Effective protection and rational development of cultural tourism resources have always been the focus of cultural tourism research. It is a top priority and an important direction for future cultural tourism research to establish and improve the interest distribution mechanism of the government, communities, local residents and tourism developers, and fully mobilize the enthusiasm of all parties to participate in the protection and development of cultural tourism resources.

Fourth, it is indispensable to link the study of cultural tourism with pastoral complexes, rural revitalization, and tourism poverty alleviation. Only by making full use of and play the function of cultural tourism, learning from the development experience of cultural tourism, and realizing the construction goal of the pastoral complex can promote the realization of the rural revitalization strategy. At present, with the acceleration of the urbanization process, it has become a general concern of the government and academia on how to protect and inherit the traditional culture of the countryside to realize the revitalization of the countryside. At present, China's targeted poverty alleviation work is in full swing. Good results have been achieved in many places. Most cultural tourism resources in poverty-stricken areas are abundant. It is necessary to fully tap the traditional cultural resources and intangible cultural heritage of poverty-stricken areas. Relevant officers and experts should develop a highly operable rural cultural tourism according to the resource characteristics of poor areas and the existing development foundation. They should organically combine the poverty alleviation plan with cultural tourism, so as to achieve targeted rural tourism poverty alleviation goals.

5. Acknowledgment

Sichuan Grassroots Cultural Service Research Center Project (JY2018B03): Research on the Construction of Urban Public Leisure Service System Based on the Improvement of Sense of Gain of the Underprivileged.

References

[1] Zhiyong Li, Yaqi Guo. Research progress and comparison of cultural tourism at home and

abroad [J]. Finance & Economy, 03 (11), pp.20-25, 2014.

[2] Jufeng Xu. Tourist culture and cultural tourism: Some issues in theory and practice [J]. Tourism Tribune, 20 (04), pp.67-72, 2005.

[3] Yingzhi Li. Modern pilgrimage: Reflections on the positioning of Fanjing Mount cultural tourism--An anthropological analysis of modern tourism [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 09, pp.185-186, 2014.

[4] Qiaoli Li. How to build a high-quality brand for Taoist cultural tourism in Wangwu Mountain [J]. Tourism Overview (Industry Edition), 10, pp.35, 2011.

[5] Xuejun Li. Some thoughts and analysis on the development of Qinghai national cultural tourism resources [J]. Vacation Tour, 04, pp.381, 2019.

[6] Yumei Guan, Dongyan Xia. A conjoint value analysis of tourism preference for Hainan Tanka culture [J]. Tourism Forum, 10 (06), pp.63-73, 2017.

[7] Xiaoyu Zhang, Xiansheng Lin. Research on the countermeasures for the development of cultural tourism in Inner Mongolia [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 11, pp.156-158, 2015.

[8] Meng Mao. Research on the types and development of Xinjiang cultural tourism products [J]. Tourism Overview (Industry Edition), 07, pp.135&138, 2011.

[9] Ziqi Xing. SWOT Analysis of Jingxi Zhuang nationality medical culture tourism [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 07, pp.181&183, 2014.

[10] Yuxi Pu. SWOT Analysis of Xiangxi ethnic culture tourism [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 09, pp.48, 2012.

[11] Xinyang Zhang, Xiuyan Li. SWOT Analysis of Liaoning Manchu culture tourism [J]. Tourism Overview (Industry Edition), 04, pp.23, 2012.

[12] Qiaoning Zhang. Tourist source market analysis of Hanzhong tea culture [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 09, pp.167-168, 2014.

[13] Xiaoxia Li. On the development of Guangxi Tea culture tourism [J]. Tourism Overview (Industry Edition), 03, pp.140, 2012.

[14] Langlang Liu. Research on Changsha film and television culture tourism from the perspective of industry integration [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 01, pp.132-133, 2017.

[15] Yongjia Guo. On the development strategy of cultural tourism in Jilin province [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 01, pp.173-175, 2017.

[16] Ailing Zhang. Study on the development of love culture tourism in Goddess Peak in Wushan county [J]. Vacation Tour, 04, pp.376, 2019.

[17] Canyu Shen, Huizhu Zeng. Research on Harbin cultural tourism development countermeasures based on tourist satisfaction [J]. Tourism Overview (the Second Half of the Month), 07, pp.145-146, 2019.

[18] Chunshan Xie, Xia Yu. Study of the cultural tourism stakeholders and their interest demands [J]. Tourism Research, 08 (04), pp.14-19&26, 2016.

[19] Xuechun Chen, Yali Ye. The development status and innovation research of Chengdu cultural tourism market [J]. Tourism Overview (Industry Edition), 09, pp.108-110, 2011.

[20] Ling Li. Talking about the new form of integration of cultural tourism and cultural industry--Taking the development of cultural and creative products of the Forbidden City in Beijing as an example [J]. Vacation Tour, 10, pp.41-43, 2018.